

Hospital Neighborhood Committee  
Sub-Committee Minutes

May 11, 2011

**Attending**

Dave Deppe-HNC member and historical home owner (retired Engineer)  
Rob Covert-HNC member and CEO Oaklawn Hospital  
Natalie Huestis-City of Marshall, Director of Community Services  
Ginger Williams-HNC member and Chief Medical Officer, Oaklawn Hospital  
Deb Axelrood-Landscape Architecture, Harley Ellis Devereaux  
Ken Jendryka-Chairman of Hospital Neighborhood Committee  
Rod Arroyo-Birchler Arroyo Associates, Inc., Vice President  
Robb McKay - State Historic Preservation Office, State of Michigan

**Discussion:**

Ken summarized, for Rod and Robb, background information on the progress of the HNC committee and sub-committee to date.

A parking study and traffic impact study are in progress with projections covering current, 4 year and 20 year time frame for the Oaklawn Hospital area.

Currently there is a 93 parking space deficit, going to 119 in 4 years and then to a 230 space deficit in 20 years. These figures are all approximate.

The biggest issues surrounding the hospitals future expansions are:

- Threat of expansion into the neighborhood
- Preservation of structures
- Flexibility in expansion options
- Growth boundaries
- Parking

In essence, the HNC and plan/overlay being formed is to bring it to a point where the “problem” is resolved. Eliminating the need for future variances for the hospital and obtaining a sense of security for the neighborhood.

The Parking Study as well as the development plans from HED project a five direction scenario. The proposed overlay lies totally within Historic Landmark District.

The Major two governmental entities involved with the Landmark district are:

- National Historic Landmark designation-Parks Dept.
- National Historic of Registered Place-Federal.

Hospital Neighborhood Committee  
Sub-Committee Minutes

May 11, 2011

Marshall has both.

There are 30 Nation wide Historic Landmark Districts (vessels, Mackinac Island, Greenfield Village, Marshall, etc.) There are a variety of things but this is the cream of the crop. When they move up to this level, that's when the parks department starts to pay attention. The Park Services Review Unit is in Omaha. It is a good idea to be proactive (Deanna Sanford).

Authority over structures, unless federal funded, is simply suggested. They could withdraw the historic designation. This is worst case scenario. No one in Michigan has ever lost theirs (but one is working on it). More often than total delisting is a "watch status" ---there's a number of them right now. Re-districting is very common and relatively painless.

Robb walked around the City and felt there were enough structures to qualify. He came up with 19 contributing plus 3 non-contributing.

Marshall is abnormal because we have many different districts in our landmark. It's a "game changer". For example, the hospital is commercial venue attached to a commercial district that is bordered by a residential district.

Robb McKay said that it is not true that once a historic structure is moved, it's lost its designation. Shuffling houses in a "middle class neighborhood" is a "so-what". The bigger picture is that it's part of a collection. Robb's argument is yes, it's still contributing. Robb used the comparison of the Stuart neighborhood in Kalamazoo. The context of the structure is important and moving the structure to a compatible district.

There is a large document put out by the Secretary of Interior for the preservation of historic properties. During discussion of design standards, its best to encourage people to follow standards. Robb does not prefer **Restoration**: recreating the building at a certain point in time. Most people will not do this, it's highly impractical. Williamsburg, Greenfield Village....are just recreations because they were built in a different time. **Rehabilitation** has a definition: maintaining the pieces that made the property historical in the first place.

These are 10 statements of philosophy in The Secretary of Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation. Basically they are a process of thinking they are not prescriptive; points to keep in mind.

Hospital Neighborhood Committee  
Sub-Committee Minutes

May 11, 2011

Include standards by reference. Rod suggested that they not be included in the overlay if there is no official ordinance to back it up. Reference other guidelines. Require that they be reviewed by the approving body.

Sides of streets have very different characteristics. Ultimate question is how tall is too tall? For example, you can't see the church steeple from downtown. Did the magic museum lose its historical value by using drive it on façade?

**Is there a way to name truly contributing structures and write in that they will be moved but attempted to be still contributing? This may give the community a level of protection. Some of those structures may be:**

**Pratt-Wright-Brooks-Crary House**

**Joanne Foster's House**

**Jackson & Jackson Business**

**Magic Museum**

**Franke Center**

An idea was to write the overlay but then give Robb's office the ability to evaluate. Their office should be compelled to ask for comments (not control). Maybe refer to section 106 instead of a particular agency in the ordinance.

Within the overlay boundaries, someone needs to define the significant structures giving them an extra layer of protection. Who decides what's actually a contributing structure? Robb agreed to make the list. Then you can go back to designation and that is your documentation and justification for saying it's significant.

Robb relayed that the north hill for parking structure may be ideal. It could hide quite a bit of the parking structure due to the grade.

Dave would like to see the process that we go through when we deal with a historical structure.

Logical steps to expand hospital and use the land of one of the structures:

- Demonstrate and prove that you've looked at all the options.
- Name the action.
- Goes to Planning Commission or Historic Commission for approval.

Robb will identify significant contributing structures within the overlay and have them to the subcommittee the week of May 23<sup>rd</sup>. Have to have all the pieces put together before

Approved 6/22/11

Hospital Neighborhood Committee  
Sub-Committee Minutes

May 11, 2011

you could present the overlay. May 27<sup>th</sup> Rod will have his draft to sub-committee. We will all meet on June 1<sup>st</sup> at 10 a.m. to review.